



























	<b>Recommendation</b>	<b>Status</b>	<b>Comments</b>	<b>Traffic Light</b>
1.	In order to avoid high costs associated with the replacement of equipment as it gets to the end of its useful life, we recommend LBM ensures sufficient capital contribution is obtained annually from the council and the partners (the service is provided for) in the form of a Sinking Fund (Capital Investment Plan) towards capital costs associated with the future replacement of cameras, recording and control room equipment.	Accomplished	CCTV section was allocated a 600K capital funds to carry out improvements to CCTV infrastructure with £85,560 spent in the 2015 2016 financial year and the remaining £514,440 in the 2016 2017 financial year.	
2.	We recommend the provision of a suitable and useful GUI (Graphics User Interface))that should be explored, adopted and exploited by the LBM CCTV scheme to ensure the benefits of the CCTV systems are maximised, recorded and data produced for the benefit of LBM and its partners.	Accomplished	The new GUI was part of the new public space contact awarded to Tyco Fire and Integrated Solutions (Tyco) and which has now been installed	
3.	We recommend the new control system should be non-proprietary so that all CCTV maintenance companies can service and support it.	On-going	Tyco are currently creating an asset list	
4.	We recommend the new control system should be delivered with a working TVNP interface.	Accomplished	TVNP (Television Network Protocol) allows the Council to share images from its cameras with Transport for London, and vice versa. The TVNP interface was installed in September 2016.	
5.	We recommend when upgrading the GUI, (Graphics User Interface)it should be specified that one	By end of the financial year	The Dallmeier recorders at remote sites are being replaced with new units	





	enabling connection to the remote site Dallmeier DVR's (Digital Video recorder)?for live view, control and replay to provide seamless system for the operators should be procured.		that will be seamlessly integrated with the new Synergy CCTV platform/GUI that was installed by Tyco.	
6.	We recommend any future recordings on upgraded and/or new equipment should be at a minimum of 12.5 ips, D1 (unless HD is introduced), 1-2 Mbs bit rate, in T/L mode and retained for 31 days.	Accomplished	This formed part of the contract specification that was awarded to Tyco in October 2015.	
7.	We recommend all operator workstations be fitted with suitable equipment and software to enable all operators to have instant access to ALL recorded images, irrespective of which cameras/recorders are viewed.	Accomplished	This was a part of the contract specification awarded to Tyco in October 2015	
8.	We recommend a full audit trail is available to managers when assessing who has produced evidence in the event of challenges to evidence or any irregularities.	Accomplished	The new GUI (Graphics User interface)which has now been installed allows to access to this information	
9.	If a new Wireless CCTV system is installed, we recommend replacing the digital recording at that point to record direct from the digital camera stream, ensuring the best picture quality.	On-going	We are in the process of performing the borough wide wireless survey to determine the viability of moving to the wireless system	
10.	We recommend until a new transmission system is installed, adding additional Dallmeier recorders to take some of the load of the existing equipment. This will allow the existing equipment to record for a longer period, or at a higher frame rate or a higher resolution.	Accomplished	As part of the Public Space contract this was achieved by removing the Dallmeier recorders and replacing them with Synectics Primary Storage Node.	





11.	We recommend any new recorders should be of a hybrid type able to record from analogue cameras and also from digital (IP) cameras that use the ONVIF (Full Title) Industry Standard. ONVIF is a set of standards that make it easy for CCTV devices or components from different manufacturers to communicate with each other.	Accomplished	This has been achieved by the installation of the new Synergy system as this is capable of recording both analogue and digital recordings	
12.	We recommend (with agreement from the operators), the video wall permanently displayed cameras are reviewed and changes to the layout are made to increase the size of image and thus decrease the number of camera images displayed.	On-going	We replaced on the 4 <sup>th</sup> October 2016 the old monitors with the new 46" LCD monitors. We are in the process of configuring the camera locations and size of display.	
13.	We recommend the council provides funding to install a GUI (Graphics User Interface) for the operators that will enable the full control of the video wall whilst providing useful management information.	Accomplished	This was installed as part of the term contract with Tyco.	
14.	Arrangements need to be made with the Tree Officer for 'Crown Lifting' where the lowest branches and growth are cut back leaving the tree to continue growing upwards. It may also be necessary to lower the wireless transmitters and receivers slightly to improve the signal under the trees.	On-going	This have been agreed with highways with the works completed and will continue as growth of the trees continues.  Open contact is available with our Tree Officer who will respond to individual requests for trees to be cut or pruned to allow the full use of CCTV cameras.	
15.	The CCTV equipment should auto-restart after power loss and the issue may be an electrical trip that is cutting out. An electrical	On going	The recommendation applies to three units in Wimbledon Village. At the moment the equipment has to be restarted manually.	

	contractor should be engaged to either change the sensitivity on the trip or arrange for a new un-metred supply to be installed.		<u>. We have now received a quote for new equipment at this site and the upgrade will take place before year end.</u>	
16.	A system report should be requested from the installers Link to explain the poor performance of this wireless system, as in theory there is ideal clear line of site from the cameras to the May Court (what Tower block are we referring to?)and from there clear line of site to the Civic Centre.	Not accomplished	This recommendation applies to six units within SWBA (South Wimbledon Business Association) The results of the borough wide wireless survey will be required before any decision is taken on next steps. The wireless survey has started in September 2016. It's performed by UK Broadband. We expect the results by the end of November. The survey will tell us whether there are sufficient lines of sight between tall buildings in Merton and which cameras could be connected to the wireless network.	
17.	We recommend the council consider its position with Virgin Media and whether it should budget for an annual spend with them of £27,000 should they decide to charge the full amount for the services being provided.	On-going	We have commissioned UK Broadband to carry out a feasibility study with regard to using wireless transmission around the borough instead of BT/Virgin lines. We expect to receive the results of the survey by the end of November and will then consider the potential savings involved and make a decision on whether to proceed with installing a wireless network. Virgin has not made any further efforts to recover charges that we may not currently be paying.	
18.	We recommend that the Control Room be upgraded to a new digital system allowing SD (Standard Definition)and HD (High Definition)cameras to be viewed, controlled and	Accomplished	It was accomplished as part of the term contract with Tyco	




	recorded			
19.	We recommend the procurement or other LBM department correctly allocates suitable disbursement codes for accounting purposes in order to track various CCTV costs across agreed headings for easier reconciliation and the management of expenditure.	Accomplished	Since Parking Services took over the CCTV budgets in April 2015 we have monitored the spend (expenditure). This data is then used as part of the budget managers monthly forecast.	
20.	We recommend the LBM reviews the need to retain spare CCTV equipment in its offices and with the adoption of a new maintenance contract, consider placing this onus to retain adequate spares upon the successful contractor.	Accomplished	The new maintenance term contract with Tyco is 'parts and labour' and not just 'labour' as the previous contract with Eurovia. That means we do not need to hold any spare equipment	
21.	We recommend that the LBM agree with Eurovia, the level, cost and extent of the maintenance programme required until a full tender procurement process is tendered and awarded and enter into an agreement with them.	Accomplished N/A any more	This was accomplished, but we have now moved to a new term contractor Tyco.	
22.	We recommend Eurovia are only awarded the work to maintain the DVR's (Digital Video Recorder) if they can provide evidence that the engineers who will be required to attend to the Dallmeier devices, 24/7 have received suitable and appropriate levels of training to work on these devices to the satisfaction of the LBM.	N/A	This is no longer applicable as the Dallmeier recording units are being replaced. Until they are replaced they are being maintained by Tyco engineers, who are suitably qualified.	
23.	The exchange of the ICON controllers currently in use in the control room, in favour of the Synectics joysticks (purchased or	Accomplished	Operators have been using Synectics joysticks since March 2015	




	loaned). ICON is a CCTV control platform, like Synergy, that was installed in the CCTV control room but which never worked to our satisfaction.			
24.	Uses the ICON management GUI Graphics User Interface for Incident Recording only and is disconnected from the mapping/joystick control	N/A	We are no longer using ICON. Incidents are recorded on the new Synergy system.	
25.	We recommend the Community Safety Department meet with all LBM departments and third parties it provides services for and agrees an SLA and contribution towards the transmission, monitoring and equipment maintenance costs.	On-going	Since the transfer of Public Space CCTV from Safer Merton to Parking Services in 2015 work has been undertaken to establish new and expand existing SLA's with our partners. There is a meeting with CMPH planned for November	
26.	It is a further recommendation that the LBC CCTV operation is staffed with a manager to manage and supervise the staff to bring the CCTV control room to the level of professional and lawful compliance expected.	Accomplished	John Lander was appointed as the Parking CCTV Operations Manager and Tom Davis as the Parking and CCTV Infrastructure Manager in July 2015. See the committee report for details of the financial savings	
27.	We recommend operator shift patterns and the need for two staff is assessed and validated.	Currently under review	The review of shift patterns and resource levels has only recently begun. Further more detailed updates will be provided to the Commission in due course. The operator shift patterns continue to be under review with final recommendations being made by the end of 2016.	
28.	We recommend the provision of professional training delivered by competent persons with knowledge and experience should be undertaken to refresh and re-motivate the LBM CCTV team.	This will be undertaken upon completion of the review and implementation of shift pattern	The timetable is subject to the outcome and implementation of the review into CCTV shift patterns. The timetable for this will depend on the outcome of item 27 however all staff	

			have received professional training in the new Synergy systems deployed in the control room.	
29.	We recommend in addition to the CoP being reinforced with the operators, the reasons for signing in to the control room with a bespoke log book should be reintroduced and all persons, who are not exempt from signing in, should be logged in and out.	Accomplished	New entry/exit secured arrangements were put in place in February 2015 and the reinforcement of the CCTV codes of practice (COP) were carried out	
30.	We recommend a fixed view camera be fitted outside the control room door enabling an immediate view by the operator of those in the corridor wishing to gain access.	Accomplished	The camera was installed in June 2014	
31.	We recommend consideration be given to installing a fixed view camera within the control room.	Not accomplished	We decided that there is no need for a camera within the control room.	
32.	We recommend LBM contemplate the risk to the existing income of circa £113,000 from MPH being ceased or seriously reduced should they decide they are not receiving value for money from the CCTV service in compliance with the SLA.	Accomplished	The new SLA agreement with CMPH has been created. There is a meeting with CMPH planned for the end of November to discuss this.	
33.	We recommend a process be established by the CCTV manager to ensure when parts or equipment are replaced or repaired on the MPH estate, these costs are captured and MPH is invoiced for the costs incurred.	N/A	No longer relevant as the new contract is fully inclusive i.e. there are no additional charges for replacements/repairs.	
34.	We recommend the LBM examine all contracts/services/SLA's it provides for internal	On-going	The review of SLA's is currently being undertaken. the progress in this area has been delayed due to	

	departments and external third parties to ensure these are cost effective and a relevant service provided for the income received.		the delay in the implementation of the ANPR and Public Space CCTV maintenance contract.	
35.	We recommend a comprehensive strategic approach with clear lines of responsibility needs to be adopted by the LBM council. One department alone should be in control of all matters relating to the use and procurement of CCTV with others requesting the use and installation of whichever department is managing the CCTV maintenance and Small Works Contracts.	Accomplished	This was achieved as a result of the transfer of the CCTV team in to Parking Services in 2015.	
36.	This public document is inaccurate and misleading and we recommend should be corrected and made relevant to the actual use and operation of the LBM CCTV system.	Accomplished	This recommendation was directed at the information on our website. It has since been changed.	
37.	A full CCTV strategy is being written as part of this CCTV audit report and we recommend this existing document be removed from public inspection.	Accomplished	The CCTV strategy was written and is available on Council's website	
38.	We recommend the CCTV Code of Practice should be re-written, made more relevant and up to date, issued to operators and made available on the Merton Council CCTV web page.	Part Completed	The control room follows the Surveillance Camera Code of Practice June 2013 published by the Information Commissioners Office. All operators have been issued with their own copy. Not yet on our Website but is available via the ICO. It is planned that the code of practice will be on our website by January 2017.	
39.	We recommend the 'Enforcement' CCTV CoP should be completed as	N/A	We are no longer using public space CCTV for enforcement purpose.	



	required and made appropriate to the LBM. It should also cross reference the PSS (Full title)CCTV system CoP.		Following the introduction of ANPR cameras in June 2016 we no longer use CCTV Control Room cameras for moving traffic contraventions, CEO's are no longer deployed to the control room. An Enforcement CCTV COP is no longer required.	
40.	We recommend a consolidated and updated OPM Operations Procedures Manual (Full Title) be compiled for LBM from the existing SOP's Standard Operation Procedures (Full Title) and other relevant sources relating to recent legislation, etc.	Partly Accomplished	A comprehensive review and production of a fully update and revised Operational Procedural Manual was completed. Updated Operations Procedures Manual and Standard Operation Procedures Manual have been produced and are available to operators. However they have not been consolidated into one document as yet but this work is continuing.	
41.	We recommend LBM addresses the shortfalls with each of the cameras identified to meet the OR, or if this is not possible to remove them from the system.	Accomplished	An evaluation of the operational requirements of all of CCTV cameras was undertaken –  Several cameras were removed and others have been moved to new positions.	
42.	We recommend that the actions contained within the PIA (Privacy Impact Assessment) documents are acted upon by the LBM together with the pixilation of camera images or enhanced; documented training of staff is carried out to ensure there is no transgression of privacy. It needs to demonstrate that a pressing need for the camera to be retained/operated continues	Partly Accomplished	We have assessed the privacy impact and operational requirement for each camera and have begun the process of adding pixelated privacy 'screens' to certain cameras that have a particularly high risk of unnecessarily infringing on somebody's privacy. For example, we have added a privacy zone to a camera on Gladstone Road so that when it is pointed towards a particular window the image is pixelated so that	

			we cannot see into the property. This process will continue now that the commissioning/installation phase of the project has been completed.	
43.	We recommend LBM undertake to add sufficient CCTV signs to its camera estate.	Accomplished	Accomplished in July 2016	
44.	We recommend the CCTV signs displayed in and around camera enforcement areas also warn motorists that in addition to public safety, the cameras are used to enforce road traffic regulations.	Accomplished	Accomplished in June 2016	
45.	We recommend the LBM consider using an incident reporting system of some type to quantify and justify the benefit and uses its CCTV system brings to the residents/tax payers and police in Merton.	Accomplished	The new Synergy software includes an incident reporting system. Which is monitored on a three monthly cycle by management	
46.	We recommend the LBM adopts a methodical and if necessary software based reporting and recording system in order to analyse and document the work, which is carried out by LBM CCTV operators.	Accomplished	The new Synergy software logs every action undertaken by operators, including recording what they are seeing on their screens	